
**MUNICIPALITY OF CARLISLE COUNCIL MINUTES
SPECIAL MEETING OF COUNCIL
DECEMBER 6, 2016 – 6:00 P.M.
760 CENTRAL AVENUE, CARLISLE, OHIO**

Mayor Randy Winkler called the Carlisle, Ohio Municipal Council Special Meeting of Tuesday, December 6, 2016 to order in Council Chambers at the Carlisle Town Hall building, 760 Central Avenue, Carlisle, Ohio. The meeting was opened at 6:00 p.m. with the Pledge of Allegiance.

Roll Call:

Mr. Randy Jewett	present
Mr. Jake Fryman	present
Mr. James Licklitter	present
Mr. Brad McIntosh	present
Mr. Jonathan McEldowney	present
Ms. Barb Tankersley	present
Mayor Randy Winkler	present

Staff members present: Village Manager Sherry Callahan
Finance Director Julie Duffy
Clerk of Council Amy Brown

The minutes of November 22, 2016 were presented to Council for review. Mr. McEldowney requested a correction to the minutes in an amount that he quoted, changed from \$8,029.99 to \$8,029.09. Mr. Licklitter made a motion to approve the amended minutes, seconded by Mr. Jewett.

Roll Call:

Mr. Jewett	yes
Mr. Fryman	yes
Mr. Licklitter	yes
Mr. McIntosh	yes
Mr. McEldowney	yes
Ms. Tankersley	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

Mayor Winkler stated that he would like to send condolences to the Byrd family on the passing of Mrs. Sharon Byrd, who was a past Carlisle Councilmember and Mayor.

Mr. McIntosh expressed his gratitude of Mrs. Byrd's service to Carlisle and he sends his condolences to the Byrd family.

Mr. Licklitter said that he sends his condolences to the Byrd family and even though he had differences with Sharon, he knew she always had Carlisle's best interests at heart. Mr. Licklitter stated that she will be missed.

Mayor Winkler thanked everyone who attended the Memorial Tree Lighting last night and thanked New Jersey Presbyterian Church for their hospitality in providing the hot chocolate, coffee, and cookies.

Public Forum:

Martin Neal, 436 W. Lomar Drive, stated that as a member of New Jersey Presbyterian Church, he thanks the Mayor for his comments. Mr. Neal said that he has been a resident of Carlisle since 1961 so he has been in this town a long time. Mr. Neal commented that he has seen bad times and good times and bad Councils and good Councils and today he would consider this Council a good Council. Mr. Neal said that he believes the wages of the hourly employees are underpaid and he has heard the arguments, but he is looking at the numbers and he believes that in today's world \$11.36 an hour is not a livable wage. Mr. Neal stated that over the years even with the downturn of the economy that wage increases did continue in most jobs across this country. Mr. Neal commented that over the last 10 years or so, we have failed in not adjusted compensation on a yearly basis. Mr. Neal believed that the hourly employees are deserving of having their compensation in line with today's world. Mr. Neal stated that he went through all of the numbers and the pay increases from his calculations range from 5% to 23%, with an average increase across the board at 15%. Mr. Neal inquired as to when the hourly employees last received a wage increase.

Mrs. Callahan commented that the employees received across the board adjustments as of this year. Mrs. Callahan noted that the pay plan moved 3% and everyone received a cost of living increase. Mrs. Callahan added that every year she has been here, she can only speak of her tenure, 6 of her last 8 years were during the recession, and 2 of those years, there were salary freezes, and stated salary increases have never been over 3%.

Mr. Neal stated that he believes we have the best hourly employees this city has ever had, they are a good group of people who are dedicated, and he would like to keep them. Mr. Neal said he believed an increase is needed at this time and it would bring our employees into a more livable wage. Mr. Neal stated that he fully supports these raises and the only reason that he would not support it would be if the town did not have the money and said that it is up to Council to give it their best shot to make sure our employees have a livable wage.

Mayor Winkler and Council thanked Mr. Neal for his comments.

Chet Miles, 621 Meadowview Court, thanked Martin Neal for coming tonight and thanked him for his comments. Mr. Miles stated that he supports what Mr. Neal is saying, but he doesn't support doing it all the first year. Mr. Miles noted that we are coming off an election year this year and the economy has been pushed up and if people follow the economy on election years, the economy always gets it, it goes way back. Mr. Miles said that through the years, it's always been that way, and he has been in business for himself, and he has gotten bit on some of these election years. Mr. Miles stated that next year, things will slow down until a new administration gets going and who knows what the new administration is going to do. Mr. Miles said that one of the things that the state has come out with today is that their money that's coming in is they are going to be 10% below what they estimated, so the first thing they said, they are going to be cutting some of the programs. Mr. Miles said that we don't know what the federal government is going to do yet, so he thinks the first year we should take a little bit of ease on this, and maybe spread this out over a couple of years or 3 years, and then go up. Mr. Miles said that if the economy is good, he is in favor of giving this 100 percent. Mr. Miles said, but as far as jumping into this first year, he didn't want to see us, yes, we are going to come out ahead this year, but we've come out ahead in an election year, but he didn't want to see what's going to happen

next year if we drop back to the old numbers. Mr. Miles said it's great to give these employees a good size wage increase, but on the other hand, if we go back on the other side of the coin, he sure didn't want to see them have to lay someone off because of what we can't afford to pay them all. Mr. Miles stated that we sure can't cut back on the wages, so we need this year to see how this is going to level out and see where we're going for a year. Mr. Miles said that all the economists said that it's going to cut back for next year. Mr. Miles said that he has seen some of the other counties and cities are going maybe across the board on a 3% and stated that we need to keep some of this money back in reserves to see what's going to happen next year. Mr. Miles said that if next year goes great, he would go and try to make up for it, but this coming year, we just don't know what's going to happen, and we don't know what Washington is going to do. Mr. Miles said that we have a governor who is going to run in 2020 and he is going to try and build his reserves up and use that as an election thing as well, and said we know that's going to happen. Mr. Miles said that now they are coming out that they are going to be cutting some of the state programs and we need to find out what's going to happen there before we go jumping in full on this. Mr. Miles stated that he appreciated the bulk of employees, but we may need to hang in there one more year and figure out see how this levels out, and see where we're really going on this. Mr. Miles stated that he remembers that in 2005 and 2006, at that time, he was living in Florida. Mr. Miles stated that he always went to the county meetings down there for 15 years and we had increases there of the tax evaluations going up there 15 to 25% and they hired new employees, and it came to 2007 and 2008 and they had to lay off half of their employees because they jumped in too hard in it and they got bit. Mr. Miles stated that he sure would not like to see that happen here because he would like to keep all of the employees and make sure that they are secure in the situation. Mr. Miles said that as far as the merit, he likes the merit program, and maybe this year, until we get back on our feet, maybe we should have a salary employee, an employee of the year for that, and the wage employee, maybe have an employee of the year on that and give that this year as far as holding the merit program. Mr. Miles stated that Council is probably going to be the one to have to do that to keep it neutral for everybody as far as giving that out and it would give the employees an incentive as well. Mr. Miles said that when you start jockeying numbers around on employees, he has seen places that have done it, and you get into a problem because one person gets a jump in the wages and the other one doesn't get it, and all of a sudden, you get a bad attitude. Mr. Miles stated that with yourself, Mayor, where you work, it's pretty well across the board all the time, your wage increases.

Mayor Winkler stated that he is a union worker and they have a contract, so he gets what the union negotiates in the contract, the same as Mr. McEldowney, he is a union employee as well, so he gets those kinds of raises as well.

Mr. Miles stated that we are not a union contract here, but basically, we need to kind of follow those numbers a little bit, as far as what you're given and we don't want to get into a place where we're jumping all over the board on wages because then after a while, you don't know where you're at.

Mayor Winkler replied that the difference is, where he is seeing it is that being a utility worker, the company always kept up with the industry standard in order to keep you at a working wage, and then negotiated with the union to give you compensation that was pretty much standard.

Mr. Miles replied that one thing that would help us in this community, you know you can't raise taxes, that's been a given, we've tried for the police department. Mr. Miles stated that the people who are on

social security, you know they are not getting a wage increase for next year, and probably the average wage is 1 to 2% that's going across right now.

Mayor Winkler asked Mr. Miles if he noticed that article that was in the paper this week in the Middletown Journal about the city of Monroe and them raising the wages of their employees to industry standards because of turnover. Mayor Winkler stated that they are trying to balance things out and he knows that Monroe is in that process currently.

Mr. Miles replied that there was one down there that only went 3% too.

Mayor Winkler stated that he means they are at the industry standard.

Mr. Miles said that was great, that he was for that 100 percent.

Mayor Winkler mentioned that it also stated in that same article that they had done their research in the surrounding communities and that Carlisle was the lowest paid in Warren County.

Mr. Miles said that he didn't want to get into a situation where the bottom falls out, where are we going? Mr. Miles said that is the thing that he is pointing out, is if it goes through and everything is working right, maybe we can double them next year or something to do that. Mr. Miles said that one thing we can't do is go into all of a sudden next year, the bottom falls out, you're not going to be able to go to the taxpayer and ask them for an increase because you know what's going to happen there.

Mayor Winkler noted that the wages for the hourly people that has been discussed is coming out of the enterprise funds, all except for a small amount of money coming out of the general fund. Mayor Winkler remarked that enterprise funds are the funds that more or less replenish themselves. Mayor Winkler stated that they are there for paying our people and using for the infrastructure and so forth. Mayor Winkler said that the general fund touches everyone, but most of this money that we're speaking of is coming out of the enterprise funds, so it's not really tax-related.

Mr. Miles questioned if the enterprise funds would always hold up.

Mayor Winkler replied that they are pretty healthy funds; it's the water, sewer, road, so that's where most of this money is coming from. Mayor Winkler stated that the biggest thing that touches the general fund is our police department. Mayor Winkler pointed out that our fire department has a levy and we have money coming in that supports the fire department; the general fund doesn't support the fire department at all. Mayor Winkler said that with the police department, we also have a levy, and that levy brings in a little over \$300,000 a year to supplement the police department, and our general fund ends up supplementing probably close to \$400,000 to \$500,000 of the police department. Mayor Winkler said that we are trying to get tax dollars or some new money coming in to support the police department and take a little pressure off of the general fund. Mayor Winkler stated that one of the reasons that he was in favor of the income tax is because income tax doesn't affect anyone who is on a fixed income, such as our senior citizens in town. Mayor Winkler said that it only affects the working people, and it doesn't affect all of them, because it kind of depends on what taxes they pay in the communities where they work. Mayor Winkler stated that he didn't think that a lot of folks really understood that, but we tried very hard to get the message out through community meetings and walking door-to-door and other means, but the community failed it twice, and that is their option. Mayor

Winkler noted that eventually we are going to have to have some new money, somewhere, somehow, to shore up the police.

Mr. Miles stated that it brings up a good point, which is economic development.

Mayor Winkler replied that we are working very hard on that.

Mr. Miles stated that he thinks we need to work harder and we are going to have to maybe put some incentives out there to get this rolling. Mr. Miles said that you have been around long enough, you know how Springboro got their economic development rolling.

Mr. Fryman stated that Springboro is also right on Interstate 75.

Mr. Miles said that they give incentives to get it going, and he forgot the name of who was in there working on it, but they did fill it up; it's been over a period of years because some of the old-timers have told him about it. Mr. Miles said that we've got a company that's doing it, and we need to get industry in here to get bodies in here because that's where our money is at. Mr. Miles stated that it was in the employees, it wasn't in the taxes of what the industry is doing itself, it's in the employees for us to survive in this town. Mr. Miles said this is where our tax structure really needs to come from to get this increase in money. Mr. Miles said that he didn't know if you need to hire a part-time person to get into economic development, or what you need to do to really push this and stay on top of it. Mr. Miles said to look at some of your other cities around us that economic development is going and said that there are 19 cities right now or industries that have state funding for a bill that just passed in this last week that's going to get state funding on their economic development for those industries that are going in. Mr. Miles stated that we really need someone who is really going after that strong because that is where our blood is going to come from.

Mayor Winkler agreed that we do need economic development here and stated that he was just in a meeting with the president of Miller Valentine a couple of weeks ago. Mayor Winkler stated that he and Mr. Fryman drove up to Columbus with the Warren County group and the president of Miller Valentine was giving him some very positive things, as they are the company that markets our Business Park. Mayor Winkler stated that he was giving some very good information, with the possibility of some economic development that he was pretty sure was going to happen. Mayor Winkler said that it hasn't happened yet, and today, he met with a businessman in the city of Miamisburg and gave him our marketing plan, and was talking with him about the possibility of a restaurant in our town. Mayor Winkler stated that he sounded promising, and he was going to look at the marketing plan a little more in depth, so we'll see where it goes. Mayor Winkler stated that he is out beating the bushes all of the time, and the way this meeting came out today was through his normal job. Mayor Winkler said it is all about getting to know the right people in the right places and hopefully things will come through.

Mr. Miles said it is interesting because people know people, and it might not be any that's in this room, but if we could put an idea into the people of Carlisle that when they are out talking to people, maybe they could be talking about how Carlisle could use some industry. Mr. Miles stated that you never know who you're going to talk to. Mr. Miles said that he has talked to a lot of people, like John Gordon of Gordon Food Services, and he knows him very well, and how he met these people was through voting. Mr. Miles said that you don't know when you're out, or when any of our citizens are out, you don't know who they are interchanging with and if we could impregnate into them that we are looking for economic

development, you just don't know where this person is going to come from. Mr. Miles stated that the sign out there is not going to sell it, the citizens of Carlisle need to sell it. Mr. Miles said that the only thing he has ever learned about economic development right here as far as being out on the street is that you never hear anything about it. Mr. Miles suggested that we could put something in our little bulletin that comes out once a month that maybe we need to talk about economic development, that Carlisle has all of these facilities. Mr. Miles said that most of these people see this property out here and you talk about it and they don't even know what it's for. Mr. Miles stated that it is something we really need to focus on hard, and yes, when we are all out here, we need to be talking about it, and we need to be talking about it in the meetings as well for the people that are watching. Mr. Miles said at least the people will know that the city is working on economic development. Mr. Miles stated that we've talked about it a couple of times, but that's about all, but we've talked about it in other meetings, but as far as the public meeting that a lot of them are seeing, we're not talking about it. Mr. Miles said we need to be talking about it in the public meetings.

Mrs. Callahan remarked that she would use caution, because a lot of times, there is a lot going on behind the scenes, and it's confidential; we're not allowed to talk about it in public.

Mr. Miles said he would agree with that.

Mrs. Callahan stated that when it comes to fruition, if it does, that's when we can publicize it.

Mr. Miles stated that what we are talking about now is not confidential at this point as far as economic development.

Mayor Winkler thanked Mr. Miles for his comments.

Mr. Miles stated that Council was all doing a great job and they just need to keep plugging away because that's the only way we're going to do it.

Mr. Neal added that power companies are notoriously below industry average on what they pay their employees even though they keep in line with other power companies. Mr. Neal remarked that our service employees make \$11.36 an hour, and in 1980, 37 years ago, he was making \$11.00 an hour 37 years ago. Mr. Neal stated that he appreciated Mr. Miles comments on economic development, but he said when he moved here in 1961, he accepted this as a bedroom community, and he likes it. Mr. Neal stated that if we get economic development, that would be wonderful, and he would like to see economic development because that means jobs for people. Mr. Neal asked Council to please keep in mind and try not to fixate on the percentage raise, but simply look at the dollars. Mr. Neal stated that he couldn't live on it, and doubts that very many of Council could either.

Old Business:

Mayor Winkler started the budget discussion by suggested they move around the dias and let each individual Councilmember state why they are not in favor of the budget or whatever comes to their mind. Mayor Winkler stated that he wasn't sure if it was someone a Councilmember was mad at, or if it was just the numbers themselves, or if there were other reasons.

Mr. McIntosh responded that he would start and he was the swing vote on this at the last meeting so he would take credit for everyone being here tonight and making everyone come. Mr. McIntosh said that

he previously stated that he was in favor of the budget as presented, but he still voted for this, because the one thing we do have is still a little bit of time so if people want to talk about it further, he is all for discussing and hearing their points of view. Mr. McIntosh stated that maybe we'll stay where we're at vote-wise, then so be it. Mr. McIntosh stated that based on his research on the numbers, the proposed numbers do put people in comparable pay scales to other communities in the area. Mr. McIntosh said that it does not make the general fund vulnerable in any way. Mr. McIntosh commented that the large majority, as Mayor Winkler said, is paid out of the enterprise funds, which he wouldn't say are recession proof, but they are systematically going to be there in the future. Mr. McIntosh said that he does appreciate Mr. Miles' concern about the upcoming year, and what could happen, and that is an unknown that we'll have to deal with, and that's why we're here to deal with anything that may come in the future. Mr. McIntosh reported that his stance on the budget is still the same, and if they were voting tonight, he would still vote yes, but he would welcome any discussion and any new proposals that would be presented.

Mr. McEldowney stated that he appreciated this Council's time and the hard work of our employees and Mrs. Duffy. Mr. McEldowney said that over the past two weeks, he has thought about this, and crunched numbers, and he thinks we can make a significant catch-up between now and January of 2018. Mr. McEldowney stated that he crunched numbers and even has them printed.

Mr. McEldowney distributed a page of new numbers to Council.

Mr. McEldowney stated that just looking at management, looking at a 5% merit for the next two years, 17 and 18, plus an automatic 2 ½ % catch-up, per year, we're looking at 7 ½ %, and stated that would be 15% between now and January 2018, which he would be supporting that. Mr. McEldowney said that looking beyond that into 2019 and 20, we would continue to examine the budget, and if we could continue the 5% merit at that point in time, that's great. Mr. McEldowney stated that if we could even do another 5% and another 2 ½ % percent in 2019, that's great if the economy continues. Mr. McEldowney stated that he thinks this is pretty similar to what was proposed, and said that some of the raises are pretty close in most areas. Mr. McEldowney said that he wanted to stay positive tonight and he brought this as a way to look at our numbers. Mr. McEldowney asked Council and challenged them to think of alternative ways and thinks this is a meaningful way to show our employees that we are dedicated to them by offering them 15% essentially over a 13 month period between now and January of 2018.

Ms. Tankersley stated that she is looking at this and she is in agreement with Mr. McEldowney and some of these after 2018 are actually going to be more than what was proposed for some of the positions. Ms. Tankersley said that the ones that are not are really close and she feels like it's the right thing to do to do it in two steps rather than one.

Mr. Lickliter stated that he has looked at this also and this is not the first time he has seen it. Mr. Lickliter said that he thinks it does two things. Mr. Lickliter said that if you look at the 2018 column, you see the actual raises are larger than the current proposal so it meets what we're trying to do. Mr. Lickliter said that the second thing it does is move it into a two year plan rather than a one year plan, which he believes also meets some of the criteria of the other people on the bench. Mr. Lickliter said while we're not going to get it all in one year, we're going to move it into two years, and he thinks that

even in some of the areas, the increases are going to be higher than the proposal, so he would support the two year plan as well.

Mr. McEldowney stated that he knows that Mrs. Callahan has mentioned looking at our salary schedule and analyzing it, making sure that our bottom and top are accurate. Mr. McEldowney said that he would like to use our retreat to look at the spectrum there to see what would be our top pay for these positions.

Mr. Fryman remarked that he still believes it should all be done in one year. Mr. Fryman stated that when we gave the cops their raise earlier this year, we compared to towns like Miamisburg, and Centerville, and we had no issue just doing it all in one year, right then and there. Mr. Fryman said that yes, we cut a position, but we rarely had all seven police officers on duty at one time, and we still found a way to give them a raise within one year. Mr. Fryman stated we didn't have to have this broken up over multiple years. Mr. Fryman noted that we have the money in the budget, and Mrs. Duffy is very conservative with her projections and offerings to us. Mr. Fryman stated that if she says the money is there, then he has to believe it to say we can do it all in one year to get them caught up now. Mr. Fryman said, yes, it should have been done long ago, and with circumstances outside of our control, previous employees here should have done this, but the fact of the matter is, we're here now, and we should just get it done now while we can. Mr. Fryman said, yes, there might be a recession tomorrow, there might be a recession four years down the road, but you can't plan on that. Mr. Fryman noted that our reserves have doubled from \$500,000 to \$1 million in the past eight years, and said that is pretty good for a town this size under our circumstances. Mr. Fryman mentioned that as aggressively as we are working to sell off the land to attract business, our reserves can only go up from here. Mr. Fryman remarked that our enterprise funds are solid, and they can support this if we do it now. Mr. Fryman stated that frankly, he is tired of messing with it, so why don't we just get it done now and move on, and if the money is there, it ought to be done that way. Mr. Fryman said that if we have to dip into reserves sometime, that may occur, but they are being built up right now, even with this current budget. Mr. Fryman said that this plan works, yes, but he still feels like it's doing too much when we can just do it all now.

Mr. Jewett started off by saying he doesn't know any of the employees and he is in Kettering from 6 a.m. to 5:30 p.m. every day, so it is not that he is mad or upset at anyone, so that is off the record. Mr. Jewett stated that he wished Mr. Neal hadn't left so soon, because he was talking about wages in 1980, 37 years ago, and a mere 25 years ago, he started out at \$6.00 an hour and he made it, it was tight, but he made it. Mr. Jewett said that has nothing to do with the wages that our current pay schedule is for the employees. Mr. Jewett stated that he has no problem with them making whatever money we set out in our pay ranges, but in the 25 years that he has worked in the private sector, he has never had a raise over 7%. Mr. Jewett said that he has had 3 times in the last 10 years, a wage freeze, and at this current time, he hasn't had a raise in over 2 years with the manufacturing economy down. Mr. Jewett stated that he has had guys that he has worked with go to other jobs and make more money, but he has stayed where he is at because that is his choice. Mr. Jewett said that the bottom line, what he is feeling is it would not be right for him; he feels he would not be doing right for the citizens of this town to do that in one huge true-up. Mr. Jewett mentioned that it has taken years to get to this point, so he would still not be in favor of the one-time true-up, and said over this two or three year period here, he would be in favor of a multiple year true-up.

Mr. McIntosh questioned the members of Council who were opposed if they were opposed because of how these wages will impact the city negatively or the image of giving large raises.

Mr. Jewett responded both. Mr. Jewett stated that he has mentioned several times that if our enterprise funds were doing so well, could we not cut the rates to help our citizens who we work for, and are part of, but that has never been able to be done. Mr. Jewett said that now all of a sudden, we turn around and we have money to take out of them for the employees, he sees opposite hands here. Mr. Jewett stated that the people of this town do not realize that we take away a parade and start charging for that, most people don't realize, and he didn't realize that the police fund is over here, and they are running short, they see a new dump truck driving down the road. Mr. Jewett said that the people don't realize that the road fund is completely separate from the police fund and those funds cannot be interchanged. Mr. Jewett said that he thinks it is what the people of the town are going to see as well.

Mr. McEldowney stated that one of his concerns is with the image and the image that we put our safety services at risk in the future needing additional tax money. Mr. McEldowney said that if we need to put on the ballot a tax increase, and the image of this increases the no vote is a concern.

Mayor Winkler stated that we have tried to educate the public by having community meetings and no one showed up. Mayor Winkler said that we have walked door-to-door to try and pass a levy and he was greeted very kindly by a lot of people, and had people that basically told him to get off their property, and it's not a pleasant thing to do to go out there, and he knocks on every door. Mayor Winkler stated that these raises are coming out of the enterprise funds, which cannot be used for safety services, so he doesn't see what we are talking about here with our hourly employees because he doesn't see how it affects safety services.

Mr. McEldowney stated he thinks it is just the image of it.

Mayor Winkler replied that you see how many people are here this evening. Mayor Winkler stated that you wanted public input, and we had two people show up out of the community, and both of them had different views.

Ms. Tankersley responded that was true, we don't have anyone show up, but that doesn't mean we aren't here to do the right thing for them. Ms. Tankersley stated that she feels like we are giving the raises that you're asking for, and absolutely, this has nothing to do with any personal thing against anybody. Ms. Tankersley said that she was upset that the Mayor even made that statement because it's not fact and because that's totally what is not even going on here.

Mayor Winkler replied that the reason he made that statement is because that statement was asked of him by the employees.

Ms. Tankersley said but you didn't say that.

Mayor Winkler responded that he was saying it now.

Ms. Tankersley said it's not about that, they are going to get the raise, they are just going to get it in 13 months instead of all right now. Ms. Tankersley stated that she feels like that's not a bad thing.

Mayor Winkler said that Mr. McEldowney made his speech about the percentage of the raises, and there were a couple of things that were in here that aren't totally accurate. Mayor Winkler said he was talking about using rainy day funds and we are not using rainy day funds, so that part of the comment was not accurate and the Mayor wanted people to know that. Mayor Winkler said that this budget does touch the general fund in a small amount of money, but the majority of this money is coming out of the enterprise funds, all but about \$7,000 is coming out of the enterprise fund. Mayor Winkler stated that actually, Mrs. Callahan has here \$3,529.00.

Mrs. Callahan responded that is how much additional money is needed from the general fund for what was proposed before you. Mrs. Callahan stated that, yes, it is \$8,029.09, but as Mr. Lickliter has said in the past meeting, there is still money from Mr. Wallace's position that has not been used which would absorb more than half of that \$8,000 that is in the general fund. Mrs. Callahan explained that it is really \$3,500 additional funds out of an \$8 million dollar budget that we are debating here.

Mayor Winkler said we did the right thing for the police department and we tried to give those folks a competitive wage to stop the flow down there of coming in one door and leaving out the other and that seems to have helped somewhat so far. Mayor Winkler stated that we did that at one time and personally, he never received one phone call telling him that we did the right thing or the wrong thing for giving our police officers an increase in pay to try and stop the turnover down there. Mayor Winkler stated that what our people make here is all public record and we've got people making, well, \$15.93 was the highest, and that was our tax administrator all the way down to \$11.36, which is our service workers. Mayor Winkler said that our utility clerk was going to go from \$13.48 to \$16.74, which is the 24% increase, and \$16.74 is still a difficult wage to try and live on these days. Mayor Winkler stated that he is with Mr. Fryman, that we have the money, we are barely touching the general fund, and as Mr. McIntosh said, our enterprise funds are pretty solid. Mayor Winkler said they are not impossible to deplete, but that's why those funds are there, and that's why you have those rates to pay your employees and use on the infrastructure in the city when it's needed. Mayor Winkler commented that he is not opposed to passing the current budget the way it is, and he appreciates Mr. McEldowney taking the time to work out these numbers to try and present us with something else, but the Mayor just doesn't see a backlash from the city because we approved numbers for the police department and he never received one phone call and he doesn't think he'll get a phone call from this, but he may now, since he has put it out there. Mayor Winkler said that he received a comment from a relatively new employee today, which is from an outsider looking in, just starting here in this community, the people that work here are absolutely fantastic and there is no drama in this building, and everyone here is dedicated to their job. Mayor Winkler said that this employee said if you have the caliber of people that you have here, and they are working for small wages, you are very fortunate.

Mr. McIntosh stated that regarding the image of passing it all at once, which he agreed that on the surface, it could look reckless or suspect to some people, but if you explained it to anyone off the street, that this does not negatively impact any funds, or make them vulnerable, it puts the employees in the comparable pay ranges with other cities, and can say that it is a balanced budget and we can afford it, he doesn't know of anyone that would have a problem with that. Mr. McIntosh said that if they do have a problem with that, they will probably vote no on any future levy anyway. Mr. McIntosh noted that they voted no on two previous levies before this budget was even thought about, which he appreciates that we want to maintain that image of being appropriate with taxpayer money, and he feels that we are all

here to do that. Mr. McIntosh stated that he doesn't think there is anyone here who does not want to do what is in the best interest of the city, he just doesn't know of anyone who would be opposed when you lay it out to them like that. Mr. McIntosh said that there are some people who chose to never be informed on anything, and they are going to have negative opinions, but he just doesn't know of anyone who would be opposed.

Mr. Fryman mentioned that one of his friends is a teacher at Preble Shawnee and last month, he was a guest speaker in his classroom. Mr. Fryman said that they always have the best questions and his friend asked Mr. Fryman to explain representative democracy to the class, and we are elected to take these chairs and sometimes make the tough choices and do the unpopular thing because it may end up being the right thing to do, and it's the logical thing. Mr. Fryman said that yes, we can break it up, or do it now, and it may look bad, but that's what we were elected to do when we are put in this chair is to make the tough choices and the right decision. Mr. Fryman said that one of the kids had a great question, which was how do you balance representing the citizens, but also the employees that work under the manager that you hire. Mr. Fryman said that he cannot vote on a budget that does not properly compensate the employees who we pay on a daily basis to go out and execute that budget. Mr. Fryman said that they ought to be fairly compensated for handling an \$8 million dollar budget in such an effective and proper manner. Mr. Fryman stated that he asked Mrs. Callahan a while ago how many employees she has had to dismiss for various reasons, and she stated just that one department, and in that time period, we have had very good employees who have done their job and made the city look very good. Mr. Fryman feels that as an elected official, it is up to him to continue that process.

Mr. Licklitter responded that we have voted in the past 3, 4, or 6 years on a budget with a 3% increase, and now we're going to jump to 20-something percent increase, so we have voted on budgets that have not truly compensated the people. Mr. Licklitter said that we have done it for the last 4 or 5 years. Mr. Licklitter said that at the end of the day, the argument is over 13 months. Mr. Licklitter stated that he thinks Mr. McEldowney has brought a pretty good proposal here because it gets us where we want to be and it just takes us a little bit longer to get there. Mr. Licklitter said that we are arguing over, do we do it now, or do we wait, do we do half of it now, or do we wait another 13 months to complete the whole thing. Mr. Licklitter stated that if we were interesting in getting the entire Council to vote and pass the budget, then that is probably what it's going to take, and if we're not interested in that, then we could probably do a 4-3 vote and get it done.

Mr. McIntosh commented that on paper it does appear to be large increases, some larger than others, and some up to 24%. Mr. McIntosh said that he has been on this Council for a couple of years now and he is embarrassed that we have to look at a 24% increase to put an employee on a comparable pay scale and it's still at the low end, very low end, of surrounding communities. Mr. McIntosh stated that it is years of neglect and that makes him feel terrible. Mr. McIntosh said that 24 is the highest example, but he thinks it is embarrassing. Mr. McIntosh stated that obviously, if you do the same thing every year, or every other year, then you have reckless spending, but just to put on the low end of a pay scale, he thinks is kind of embarrassing.

Mr. Licklitter stated that he thinks we have discussed it enough.

Mayor Winkler replied that we do not have a reading on for tonight.

Mr. Licklitter questioned if we could do a reading, and vote on the budget tonight, and move forward.

Mrs. Callahan replied that there will be a reading on the 13th.

Mr. McIntosh stated that the legislation can be put on for emergency at that time.

Mrs. Callahan stated that the press has to be notified and she didn't know there would be any voting tonight, she believed there would just be discussion, and the press and the public was not advised that we would be voting on anything tonight, it was just under Old Business.

Mr. Licklitter asked if we have to advise them of everything that we vote on.

Mrs. Callahan replied that by law, we have to notify them 24 hours in advance.

Mr. McIntosh questioned Mrs. Callahan if she had spoken with Rusty Clifford regarding a Council Retreat.

Mrs. Callahan replied that she had not reached out to him, and she would contact him but she would need a consensus from Council to reach out to Dr. Clifford.

Roll Call:

Mr. Jewett	yes
Mr. Fryman	yes
Mr. Licklitter	yes
Mr. McIntosh	yes
Mr. McEldowney	yes
Ms. Tankersley	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

There was a unanimous decision among Council for Mrs. Callahan to contact Dr. Rusty Clifford to facilitate an upcoming Council Retreat.

There being no further business or discussion, Mr. Licklitter made motion to adjourn, seconded by Mr. McIntosh.

Roll Call:

Mr. Jewett	yes
Mr. Fryman	yes
Mr. Licklitter	yes
Mr. McIntosh	yes
Mr. McEldowney	yes
Ms. Tankersley	yes
Mayor Winkler	yes

Meeting adjourned at 7:10 p.m.

Date: _____

Mayor

Attest: _____
Clerk of Council